

The Tallinn Manifesto





The Tallinn Manifesto

The Tallinn Manifesto calls for a re-think in how we approach creative entrepreneurship for a competitive economy.

It sets out an agenda for a refreshed and re-invigorated approach to knowledge development, collaboration, strategy and policy – across Europe and internationally. It introduces a set of themes which will help different localities to maximise their distinctive potential; and it frames questions which we should all have strong answers for if we are serious about developing a Creative Economy which is productive, value-adding, sustainable, resilient, inclusive and fair. It does this from the specific perspective of emerging markets – to bring the ‘margins’ to the ‘centre’ so that a new wave of nations, regions and cities are able to develop genuinely productive Creative Economies on their own terms.

Positioning the Tallinn Manifesto

The role of the Creative Economy as a provider of growth to the wider economy and contributor of added value to a range of agendas, is by now familiar to many. Indeed, multiple nations, regions and cities have invested substantially in Creative Economy strategies and programmes, with aims that range from creating jobs, attracting investment, building confidence and embedding creativity across other sectors – even across society as a whole.

However, with the economic crisis, plus through more developed critical thinking, we need a re-think on the role and value of the Creative Economy and a refreshed approach to policy and strategy.

Therefore, in October 2011, Enterprise Estonia together with Creative Estonia, Estonian Ministry of Culture and Ministry of Economic Affairs

and Communications organised a major international conference to call for a paradigm shift in the way the Creative Economy is understood and supported: www.creativeestonia.eu

With a programme of speakers from 12 countries and 200 delegates from all over the world, the conference was the major event for Creative Economy policy and development in 2011. The conference was programmed and facilitated by leading international Creative Economy expert, Dr Tom Fleming: www.tfconsultancy.co.uk

Tom Fleming’s role was to introduce critical thinking, generate debate and provoke innovation in the ways we discuss the Creative Economy, how and on what terms we collaborate, and on what basis we develop strategy and policy to maximise the potential of the Creative Economy in each distinctive context.

The Tallinn Manifesto and

Open Tool for Strategic Development across the Creative Economy

The purpose of the Tallinn Manifesto is to provide a stimulus and focus for debate, which then develops as a driver for strategy and policy. At the conference in October 2011, the Manifesto was discussed and re-shaped through the direct input of delegates and speakers. This, the 2nd version of the Manifesto, incorporates recommendations from speakers and delegates.

This establishes the Manifesto as the first open conference tool for the co-creation of strategic frameworks across the Creative Economy. It also reinforces the position of Tallinn as a progressive and innovative city for the Creative Economy; a place that takes a leadership role in the development of ideas, knowledge, policy and action.

The 5 Themes & 26 Recommendations of the Tallinn Manifesto

The following themes and recommendations set out opportunities to take a refreshed and re-invigorated approach to Creative Economy development. The 'we' referred to throughout is the network of policy-makers and strategists, opinion-formers and intermediaries - who collectively can make such a difference to the health and dynamism of our overall Creative Economy. The task is not for Tallinn to act alone but for a collective and collaborative approach.

Theme 1: Creative Talent

The post-crisis creative economy requires a mix of skills and competencies, both within and outside the Creative Economy. This is a critical agenda, not least in Europe where youth unemployment has spiked well above 20% in many regions. Here there is a need to reconceptualise what we mean by a 'creative education' and develop new progressive models to ensure creativity is a pervasive asset across society. This includes developing approaches that genuinely embed creativity and cultural activity as core elements of a balanced education.

It is important here to ensure harder to reach and disadvantaged young people have access to and benefit from such approaches, so the full range of talent is given equal opportunities for a creative education. Up to now, the main beneficiaries of growth in the Creative Industries have been middle class, white and proportionately male. Just as we need to re-balance our econo-

mies, we need to re-balance the Creative Economy, ensuring the full diversity of talent benefits from future growth and guaranteeing harder to reach communities a stake in our creative futures. In turn this will make our Creative Economies more innovative and competitive because they will draw on a wider range of available talent.

It is also important here to develop stronger partnership with industry so that further and then higher education delivers the skills and competencies to enable growth and sustainability across the Creative Economy. This means we need to open up our education institutions so that they are genuine hubs of creative and knowledge exchange, delivering value to and receiving value from industry, as well as ensuring we support socially engaged creative practice that directly benefits local communities. And it is important here that we ensure our creative workforce is constantly up-skilling and re-skilling, growing in confidence and capacity as careers develop and businesses grow.

Tallinn Recommends:



1. We position creative and cultural education as an absolute entitlement for young people throughout their formal and non-formal learning journeys. We need to support teachers and other educators to enable this, and develop capacity and competency in the arts and creative sectors so they can operate as effective service providers. This is a non-negotiable for a competitive, sustainable and resilient economy.

2. We develop targeted initiatives to develop employment and sustainable careers for young people - as an urgent priority. This is to attend to the global crisis in youth unemployment: activities in the creative industries are labour intensive and help to develop core critical skills transferable to other sectors, as well as jobs in their own right. Creative apprenticeships have a major role to play here - brokering employment opportunities in the Creative Industries. In addition, projects which seek to directly create jobs for young people, such as the British Council-led 'Future City Jobs', should be scaled-up to deliver Europe-wide impact on youth employment in the Creative Economy.

3. We open up our higher education sector to play a more proactive role in skills development for creative entrepreneurs and knowledge exchange for the wider Creative Economy. This means dedicated industry partnership, a more entrepreneurial approach to developing new business models from within academic institutions, and a genuine exchange that drives up innovation and productivity in collaborating businesses outside such institutions. This should focus on endowing entrepreneurs with a set of core skills for their business life (in

management, markets and money), developing socially engaged practice with local communities (putting creativity and arts into place-making), exploring boundary-crossing experimentation with other institutions and businesses, and of course retaining an approach that delivers excellence in the creative arts.

4. We position innovation as a core practice for every creative entrepreneur. Innovation doesn't have to mean radical and disruptive practice based on extreme collaboration: it is for everyone. We need to support our creative businesses and the wider Creative Economy to develop incremental innovation and embed 'intrapreneurship' as an essential perspective for business renewal and development.

5. We ensure professional development and learning are continuous in their availability and multi-faceted in their offer - so that our creative entrepreneurs encounter new ways of working and develop the range of competencies necessary for survival and then growth over the course of their careers. This should also focus on enabling 2nd and 3rd careers to prosper - enabling older creative entrepreneurs to set up and flourish and supporting collaboration that is inter-generational and intercultural - so that our full talent base is embraced.

6. We develop capacity and skills in digital technology - for entrepreneurs and for consumers. By increasing access to digital technology and the platforms it enables, and by nurturing confidence in this domain, we will flatten digital divides, grow markets and increase the capacity of creative entrepreneurs to reach and engage these markets. •

Theme 2: Creative Business - Driving Innovation and competitiveness across the economy

The last ten years and more have seen the rise of targeted business development services, investment programmes and cluster initiatives. They are all based on the assumed 'exceptionalism' of creative businesses. For example, they are designed to appeal to the challenges many creative businesses have in balancing the creative and commercial, independent and corporate, cultural and managerial; the inherent flexibility required of many creative businesses - which are in many cases relatively small, portfolio-driven and project-focused; and the difficulties such businesses face in maximising the commercial potential of their intellectual property and attracting appropriate investment for growth.

We need a critical review here - to better understand what has and hasn't worked. For example, we need to explore whether such approaches actually separate creative businesses from the rest of the economy - exaggerating their 'exceptionalism' and reducing their capacity to attract mainstream investment and develop markets. Does special treatment mean that creative businesses (and especially those which operate in a mixed economy with a strong link to public investment) actually pull away from the rest of the economy and fail to deliver significant value as a consequence?

We also need to explore here what works in different contexts and at different scales. For example, what does 'growth' look like in a small regional city or a major metropolitan hub? In such contrasting contexts, what types of Key Performance Indicators should we be setting for specialist sector support programmes? How can we

maximise the links between support for creative businesses and the rest of the economy? And how can we ensure creative businesses play a more central role for the overall economy - such as to the wider innovation ecosystem or as a positive influence on cultural tourism?

In addition, we need to grasp more effectively where growth and competitiveness is likely to come from in the future. Here, digital technology has disrupted yesterday's business models and opened up huge opportunities for creative businesses to reach new markets, scale up their operation and diversify their practice. At the same time, market opportunities are shifting like never before - with a hunger for digital content equalled with a rising appetite for live experiences (such as in music); with a rapidly growing middle class in 'developing economies' (such as the BRIC nations)¹ seeking those goods and services that enable differentiation and status (i.e. the outputs of the Creative Industries); and with growing convergence enabling creative businesses to deliver services that are core to overall economic competitiveness (such as design).

Notionally, this opens up major opportunities for the 'smaller players' in the global Creative Economy - introducing entry points for businesses and organisations limited by the size of their local markets and by technological and cultural barriers to accessing new markets. But this also introduces challenges - such as how to build the required digital capacity for our creative businesses to genuinely prosper, how to develop clear identities and brand narratives that appeal to emerging markets, and how to collaborate across the wider economy in ways that are non-exploitative and transparent.

¹ *Brazil, Russia, India and China.*

Tallinn Recommends:



1. We position our Creative Economies as central to our overall competitiveness and well-being – not as a junior partner to biotech, finance or service industries. This means commitment and leadership from a Government to institutional level, collaborating to explore ways that maximise the value of creativity to society – from higher value jobs to well-being.

2. We attend to the specific elements that make creative businesses and entrepreneurs ‘exceptional’, and integrate approaches where such exceptionalism doesn’t exist. For example, introduce investment readiness activities for creative businesses but only introduce targeted investment where there is real evidence of market failure in mainstream investment sources (such as retail banks, equity funds etc.). For example, introduce export insurance incentives for businesses trading in creative goods and services only where there is evidence of weaker exports for such businesses because of inaccessibly high insurance costs. This requires an evidence-based approach and one grounded on knowledge rather than aspiration.

3. We open up international markets for creative businesses by brokering peer exchanges between entrepreneurs working in different markets. Just as we encourage exchange between policy-makers (see Theme 5), we should encourage both knowledge and trade-focused collaboration between different creative businesses. This is particularly important in smaller

markets where access to skills and different types of capital is limited. We can support our creative entrepreneurs to ‘scale-up’ through international collaboration.

4. We develop a set of globally recognised metrics for valuing intangible assets. This means mapping effective business models, tracking returns on investment, and balancing an appreciation of the different assets in a business (or consortia of businesses) – such as in management, finance, marketing and technology.

5. We radically revise our approaches to measuring and articulating the value of creativity, culture and the overall Creative Economy – e.g. to specific cities, regions and nations. We need to co-create coherent and consistent approaches to measurement and to road-test new methodologies across a network of international case studies. This is to establish a tool-kit and guide for the measurement of creativity in the economy. It should include social outcomes and the development of creative communities, as well as pure economic / monetary outcomes.

6. We enshrine creativity in planning policy – building on previous ‘% for arts’ schemes to incentivise investment in design, arts and other creative services as an integral part of the planning and development process. This builds a market for our creative entrepreneurs and embeds creativity across the physical and social fabric of our towns and cities. •

Theme 3: Creative Infrastructure for a New Age

With increasing digitisation comes greater convergence (in how products and services are produced and consumed), which in turn requires our creative businesses and organisations to be more interdisciplinary, open and collaborative. For a growing and sustainable Creative Economy, we need to develop infrastructure that enables creative businesses to collaborate - with one another and with the rest of the economy. It is particularly important here to nurture much more open and interactive relationships between the arts and more commercially driven Creative Industries. This means arts organisations and artists operating more entrepreneurially to open up revenue streams and reach audiences in deeper and more meaningful ways. This also means creative businesses uniting more productively with the arts - to co-create ideas, cross boundaries to develop new content and experiences, and ensure excellence is honed as a basis for growth and competitiveness.

Our arts and cultural infrastructure has an important role to play here - moving beyond art-form-specific and building-based approaches to become real hubs of creative production and consumption and genuine spikes where the artistic and commercial grow together. The best arts and cultural infrastructure is seamlessly digital and

physical, civic and communal, operating as a broker of flows and experiences, a facilitator that allows audiences, practitioners and businesses to encounter excellent art, co-create the meaning of that art, and collaborate to create new art. Here, our best theatres, galleries, museums, cinemas, libraries and arts centres are at once centres for aesthetic indulgence, hubs for creative business, intersections of knowledge exchange, and enablers of innovation. Yet they are too few, too fragile, and too often neglected. Moreover, too many of our arts and cultural institutions lack the capacity, confidence and connections to genuinely drive collaboration and growth in the Creative Economy.

Ideally, every town or city of any scale would have arts and cultural organisations with infrastructure that genuinely brokers and enables the flows between the arts ecology and Creative Economy. Here we need to develop new thinking on the types of infrastructure required to deliver innovation and growth across the Creative Economy. We need to learn from the growing body of good practice, and new models for arts and cultural infrastructure, workspace, networks and a range of support services should be introduced and tested.

Tallinn Recommends:



1. We position our arts and cultural infrastructure to the heart of our Creative Economy. This means building capacity and confidence for the arts and cultural sector to become more entrepreneurial, collaborative and open. It means we position our libraries, theatres, galleries, museums and cinemas as spaces of convergence and interdisciplinary practice, as hubs of creative business, sites of cross-sector exchange, and as providers for creative education and talent development.

2. We support arts and cultural organisations to flourish in a mixed economy. Broadening the range of revenue sources for arts and cultural organisations is a must if the arts economy is to be sustainable and grow and if it is to play a more progressive role for the Creative Economy. This means coordinating blended investment across arts and culture, the brokerage/leverage of different types of co-investment, encouraging crowd-funding, pursuing new business models, and growing and then embedding a culture of philanthropy.

3. We develop digital capacity across the arts and cultural sector - to enable audiences to be reached and engaged in new, often deeper ways; to support the collaboration between different organisations (sharing content, audiences and knowledge); and to develop new, productive

and scalable business models so the arts and cultural sector play a much larger direct role for the Creative Economy.

4. We leverage this digital capacity to encourage innovation and extend reach across the arts and cultural sector - such as in coordinated programming, commissioning of talent and shared approaches to management.

5. We commission interdisciplinary research and practice between the arts and wider economy - such as with technologists, scientists, planners and core municipal services. This is to explore the wider value of arts practice and creative thinking across the economy and society.

6. We pilot new and emergent workspace models - from flexible digital creative networks that feed physical hubs (e.g. creative membership models), to creative home-working, to pop up activities in old industrial and retail spaces.

7. We invest in and champion innovation in our arts and cultural infrastructure - where constant renewal, knowledge development and experimentation are a core business. This means moving beyond the needs of core audiences and re-defining excellence to include a willingness to take risks and collaborate to innovate. •

Theme 4: Creative Cities and Regions

For more than a decade, many cities and regions have developed strategies and policies for the Creative Economy. Often these are underpinned by robust approaches to sector mapping and consultation, yet equally often they are not. In a time of overall economic growth, cities and regions were able to position the Creative Industries as critical drivers of their rejuvenated economies, diversifying the economic base, providing jobs and enhancing overall confidence. Yet in a time of economic downturn, we see that in many places the role and impact of the Creative Industries was exaggerated and used as much as a tool in civic boosterism as real and substantive economic development. We also see that the Creative industries in many places remained an exclusive sector, without delivering much value to the relatively disadvantaged and long-term unemployed.

Perhaps too many places adopted the term 'creative' as a pre-fix for their civic, cultural and economic aspirations. This is a difficult suggestion to make - after all, who can argue that being 'creative' is negative or unproductive? But with literally hundreds of cities and regions pinning their previous growth plans and now their recovery plans to a loosely conceptualised creative agenda, we need to re-introduce real rigour and much sharper strategic thinking if such places are to genuinely benefit from their Creative Economies.

To begin with, we need to reflect on how some cities and regions have successfully nurtured sustainable and resilient Creative Economies, while others have struggled. We need to better understand how creative entrepreneurs are operating to change cities and regions after the

downturn, exploring the different types of enabling conditions which enable creative businesses to flourish. And we need to work with our politicians and policy-makers so that they don't take the easy option with a 'creativity agenda', but they develop a commitment to structured, realistic and evidence-based approaches to sector development.

This means we need to reposition and repurpose the Creative Economy for a new age of city-making and regional development where the gap between rhetoric and reality is much narrower. This also means accepting that in some places the Creative Industries will not and may never be a major sector in its own right. In such places we need to work harder to lever different types of value from the Creative Industries, from arts and culture, and from creative approaches to planning and development. In such places we need to explore the value of creativity in a more holistic way - in how we develop skills and competencies, how we improve competitiveness in manufacturing and services, how we 'widen the shoulders' of our tourism sector, and how we enable innovation to flourish.

We also need to work harder to realise the social capital of creativity - in building confidence, connecting communities and nurturing well-being. Indeed, in such contexts, the opportunity to develop a sustainable, resilient and competitive Creative Economy can genuinely be pursued and delivered on. This means we need to develop a community-based approach to the Creative Economy - based on a 'civic economy' (NESTA 2011) where decision-making is open and accessible to local people and the 'Creative Economy' is made meaningful on their terms. Key here will be positioning cultural infrastructure and other spaces as a new generation of 'civic cultural centres' (Inteli 2011) which promote community entrepreneurialism based on inspirational collaboration between different types of people.

Tallinn Recommends:



1. Each city/region establish a Creative Commission to drive strategy and policy development across the Creative Economy.

This is to ensure a bespoke and nuanced approach is taken that builds from the specific strengths of the local Creative Economy and attends to its weaknesses in a joined-up way. This should be the major public private partnership for sector development and the core means of ensuring agendas from education to regeneration, economy to arts, are joined up. This should also promote more socially-driven, inclusive and 'bottom-up' approaches to creative development, ensuring it is not just the privileged few who benefit.

2. We develop open and collaborative platforms for creative exchange and trade as the next generation of Creative Clusters.

These are interdisciplinary, often distributed across cities or even between cities, and not rigidly demarcated by planners. Our arts and cultural infrastructure plays an important role here - as hubs and connectors. We should also encourage flexible approaches to workspace - opening up our cities through digital technology, supporting smarter transport solutions, and encouraging the city overall to be viewed as a place where work, home and play converge.

3. We develop local procurement strategies and programmes for our creative businesses: market-making across the economy.

This brokers relationships between creative businesses and other sectors - such as in manufacturing, finance and retail. This can be incentivised - such

as through 'Creative Credit' schemes that encourage 'non-creative' businesses to invest in the services of their 'creative' peers.

4. We promote community entrepreneurship - locally embedded joint action to develop creative experiences, activities and enterprises.

This can range from local creative centres to community creative business networks, local creative procurement and exchange projects to investment tools for social enterprises in the Creative Industries.

5. We introduce new guidance on Creative Economy strategy and planning for smaller cities and peripheral regions.

Much Creative Economy strategy and policy is driven by a metropolitan 'big city' agenda - where markets are big, skills pools deep, and 'critical mass' guaranteed. Most people do not live and work in such contexts - so we need to establish effective networks and knowledge that enables non-metropolitan places to maximise the potential of their Creative Economies on their own terms.

6. We establish a global creative knowledge bank

- driven by Tallinn: to bring together good (and less successful practice) in creative city- and place-making, delivering an open digital platform. Disseminating quarterly bulletins, holding an annual Creative Cities Symposium and pioneering new demonstrator projects in Creative Clusters and Creative city- and place-making more generally. •

Theme 5: Creative Leadership

At a time of significant economic, social, cultural and technological change, our Creative Economies need strong, committed and purposeful leadership. Approaches to the Creative Economy have been fragmented and unfocused, bureaucracy often stands in the way of progressive intervention and collaboration, the relationship between the arts and Creative Industries is under-conceptualised and blurred, and for every successful targeted initiative, wider policies (such as in education or taxation) have undermined sector development.

Moreover, some of the more progressive approaches - such as those which open up our arts and cultural infrastructure to play a leadership role for the Creative Industries, or those which deliver work-related learning for aspiring young people - are faced with resistance both within and outside the organisations charged with delivering positive change.

If we are to prosper as Creative Economies, we need strong, effective and coordinated leadership.

This means:

Policy and Strategy Leadership: with National and Regional Government and Municipalities coordinating their approaches through a set of clear, integrated and complementary approaches to the Creative Economy. Top level Creative Economy Strategies are vital here - delivering blueprints for growth and competitiveness and ensuring the approach to creativity is holistic and comprehensive - touching agendas in education, economy, culture and society.

Sector Leadership: with business, arts and culture, and education joining forces to drive innovation across their sectors and in collaboration with Government and their audiences/markets/beneficiaries.

Knowledge Leadership: with strategy and policy based upon rich and robust evidence base and constantly reviewed and evaluated. Government and education institutions can play a leading role here (alongside expert consultants and think tanks) to deliver the information the sector needs to flourish. In the future, strong creative economies will be serviced by a committed approach to knowledge, with competitive advantage delivered to those with knowledge advantage.

It also means opening up approaches to creative strategy and policy so different communities of interest can take a lead - with a priority on young, engaged but under-supported talent.

Tallinn Recommends:



1. A Creative Economy Development Programme and Green Paper for each nation and global region (e.g. EU): to develop a holistic and coordinated approach that positions creativity as central to economic, social and environmental sustainability and competitiveness. This should be collaborative, involving business, education and culture. It should be evidence based and mission neutral (i.e. it should not set aspirations for the Creative Economy without first identifying and agreeing what is possible).

2. We coordinate cultural and creative leadership programmes across Europe (and other global regions) - to develop capacity, confidence and know-how for key decision-makers and intermediaries. This should connect regions (such as the Generator model in Sweden) and nations (such as the Eurocities Creative Industries network and European Creative Business Network).

3. We develop platforms for a next generation of creative leaders - utilising platforms such as the European Creative Business Network, Future City Jobs and European Capital of Culture programmes to open up leadership opportunities for young people, minority communities, and people from smaller cities and rural areas. It should also focus on brokering peer relationships between leaders working in different though interdependent areas - such as education and economy; or community and innovation.

4. A commitment from cities and regions to develop refreshed mapping of their Creative Industries sector and to develop methodologies that map the wider value-creating role of creativity. This mapping data and intelligence should

be geared toward supporting a joined-up approach to creativity in society - not just for targeted and under-connected interventions in business support, regeneration, community, education, skills and innovation.

5. 'Made Here' - Market-making for our Creative Economies: a committed approach to nurturing markets for locally produced and 'sustainable' creative goods and services, and to promoting these assets to emergent markets. Pan-national approaches should be considered here - to coordinate the efforts of smaller countries and deliver greater impact at the global marketplace.

6. The development of knowledge and intelligence bulletins for each market - to enhance competitiveness and confidence across the Creative Economy. *These could include:*

- **A focus on market / audience behaviour and consumption** - Going beyond audience profiling to action research on new types of consumption, patterns of consumption, barriers to consumption, the disruptive and productive role of digital technology, and the ways markets are changing (and the business models required to reach these markets).

- **A focus on Innovation and productivity** - To develop greater understanding on the contribution of the arts and Creative Industries to wider innovation, how this can be increased and expressed. Equally, greater and improved research is required on issues to do with productivity - including the impact of collaborative ecologies in the Creative Economy and the ways many new clusters, rather than driven by a few large players, are aggregations of multiple micro-businesses and organisations with many complex interdependencies. •

“When faced with a crisis,
people do one of two things.
Either they ignore it and carry on,
in the hope that repeating what they
did before will work better,
or they innovate their way out of trouble
and make a new future”

(After The Crunch CCI Skills 2009).



CREATIVE ENTREPRENEURSHIP
for a Competitive Economy

There is a need overall to re-frame the policy approach to the Creative Economy. We need to explore how best to connect agendas in arts, culture, economy, community and education so that holistic yet actionable Creative Economy policy can be established.

This is the central commitment of the
Tallinn Manifesto for the Creative Economy

The conference is supported by the European Social Fund.







KULTUURIMINISTEERIUM
ESTONIAN MINISTRY OF CULTURE



tom fleming / creative consultancy /

